

**MINUTES
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
THURSDAY, AUGUST 21, 2008, 9:00 AM.**

Board Members Present at Roll Call: Les Abrams, Gabe Corral; Cynthia Henry, Michael Marquess, Debbie Rudd. A quorum was present. Board Members Present after Roll Call: Victor Hartsfield; Myra Jefferson. Board Members Absent: None. Vacant Board Member Positions: Certified General Appraiser; Public.

Also Present at Roll Call: Debb Pearson, Executive Director; Beckie Loar, Regulatory Compliance Administrator; Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General. Also Present after Roll Call: Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office.

Les Abrams acted as Chairperson.

The Board pledged allegiance to the flag of the United States of America.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2673, Calvin E. Walls/2674, Clinton E. Walls.

Respondent in 2673 appeared. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matters be referred to investigation. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted 4-1 in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess voted no.

Victor Hartsfield joined the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2663, Keith Stepter.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Debbie Rudd moved that the Minutes of the July 17, 2008, Regular Board Meeting be approved. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted 5-0 in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral abstained.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2664, Derek Rodriguez.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2677, Christina M. Geisler.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2668, Kristen A. Scalpone.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2508, Theodore R. Wall.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board grant Respondent until 9/11/08 to complete his remedial education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2503, Randall P. Jacobs.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2413, Enzo Garino.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve the substitute education to complete Respondent's disciplinary education required by the 11/21/07 due diligence consent letter. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2555, Kandace L. Levi.

Respondent appeared and was represented by Michael Orcutt, Esq. Michael Marquess moved that the Board approve Respondent's counteroffer as amended by the Board. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Myra Jefferson joined the meeting.

Review and Action Concerning 2385/2386/2387/2388/2389/2390/2391, William H. Moffett.

Respondent did not appear but was represented by Michael Orcutt, Esq. In its 12-month file review, the Board noted that Respondent has signed the proposed Consent Agreement and Order.

Review and Action Concerning 2550, Cynthia L. Huscroft.

Respondent appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report, with exceptions. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2675, S. Deborah Talleri.

Respondent, her trainee, and the complainant appeared. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

Review and Action Concerning Nonresident Temporary Application 7423, Richard A. Ribacchi, and Nonresident Temporary Application 7481, Byron N. Lea.

Applicant Lea appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board deny Nonresident Temporary Application 7423, Richard A. Ribacchi, and Nonresident Temporary Application 7481, Byron N. Lea, pursuant to A.R.S. §§ 32-3617 and 32-3603. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. Gabe Corral moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, the motion failed 3-4 upon the following roll call vote: Les Abrams—no; Gabe Corral—yes; Victor Hartsfield—no; Cynthia Henry—no; Myra Jefferson—yes; Michael Marquess—no; Debbie Rudd—yes. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find Nonresident Temporary Application 7481, Byron N. Lea, substantively complete. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The motion was withdrawn. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board deny Nonresident Temporary Application 7423, Richard A. Ribacchi, pursuant to A.R.S. §§ 32-3617 and 32-3603. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Nonresident Temporary Application 7481, Byron N. Lea, substantively complete. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted 6-1 in favor of the motion. Myra Jefferson voted no.

Informal Hearing Concerning 2634, Gwendalynn M. Partlow.

Respondent appeared, was sworn in, made statements to the Board and answered the Board's questions. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a due diligence consent letter citing violations and requiring disciplinary education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted 6-1 in favor of the motion. Victor Hartsfield voted no.

Review and Action Concerning 2307, Razvan P. Silvas.

Respondent and Paul B. Johnson, his mentor, appeared. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board deny Respondent's request for termination of his probation and mentorship; that Respondent find a new mentor for Board approval within 30 days; that three new appraisal reports be submitted for Board approval; and based upon the mentor's failure to control his signature, that he not act as a supervising appraiser for one year. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, joined the meeting.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing with Formal Hearing Concerning 2325, Mark L. Andrews.

Respondent appeared. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve the education submitted late to comply with Respondent's 9/20/07 Consent Agreement and Order and that the Board rescind its referral to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Regarding Issues Dealing with Formal Hearing Concerning 2418, Lance R. Freeman.

Respondent appeared and was represented by Michael Denious, Esq. Jeanne Galvin, Assistant Attorney General, represented the State. Christopher Munns, Assistant Attorney General, Solicitor General's Office, advised the Board. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board go into Executive Session for legal advice. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Upon return from Executive Session, Debbie Rudd moved that the Board reject Respondent's second counteroffer. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board reoffer its original Consent Agreement and Order and if not signed, the matter proceed to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). The Board voted 6-1 in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess voted no. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2670, Tiela R. Norris.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2240, Anna M. Diaz.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) alleging noncompliance with the 11/1/07 Consent Agreement and Order. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2380, Timothy J. Morris.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2421, Michelle T. Carabello.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve Eldon D. Bates, Certified Residential Appraiser #20187, as Respondent's mentor. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2428/2429/2430, Douglas E. Grever.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be tabled to allow Respondent's 90-day renewal grace period to expire. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2432, Remigio S. Belmonte.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) alleging noncompliance with the 11/21/07 due diligence consent letter. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

PUBLIC ANNOUNCEMENTS AND CALL TO PUBLIC

Kim Kobriger, Certified General Appraiser #31477, filed a Call to Public, and spoke to the Board concerning suspensions, nonresident temporary applications, and the Financial Institutions Reform, Recovery, and Enforcement Act (FIRREA).

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2460, Angus Hopkins III.

Respondent did not appear. Gabe Corral moved that the Board accept Respondent's remedial education to be used for continuing education. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2473, Brooke P. Keene-Camacho.

Respondent did not appear. Gabe Corral moved that the Board accept the disciplinary education late to comply with the 1/11/08 due diligence consent letter. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2480, Lisa S. Speelman.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2493, Dawna Rogers.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the remedial education late to comply with the 1/2/08 nondisciplinary letter of remedial action. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2497, Michael D. Schendel.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) alleging noncompliance with the 5/13/08 Consent Agreement and Order. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2537, David M. Hossfeld.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board table the matter to allow Respondent to submit his proposed mentor for approval. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2557, Joel N. Reissner.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board rescind its prior Consent Agreement and Order offer. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a due diligence consent letter citing violations and requiring disciplinary education. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2593, Debbie M. Robinson.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the Board table the matter to be placed on the Board's agenda if the signed due diligence consent letter is not received. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2594, Christine J. Kelsey-Gray.

Respondent did not appear. Cynthia Henry moved that the Board invite Respondent to an informal hearing. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2621, Jaime Topete.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2516, Timothy R. Fortunato.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board reject Respondent's counteroffer and that the matter proceed to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2632, Rodney L. Martensen.

Respondent did not appear. Michael Marquess moved that the matter be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) alleging noncompliance with a Board order. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2481, Daniel W. Mahoney.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the investigative report be returned to the investigator for additional information. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2598/2599/2600/2601/2602/2603/2604/2605/2606/2607/2608/2609/2610/2611/2612/2613/2614/2629, Marc J. Seigleman.

Respondent appeared telephonically. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that 2598 through 2612, inclusive, and 2614 be dismissed for lack of evidence. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that 2613 and 2629 be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2642, Gayle A. Tiffany-Loftus.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2645/2646, Dianne M. Benedict.

Respondent appeared. Staff summaries were read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level II violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of remedial action citing violations and requiring remedial education. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2579, Jared R. Flores.

Respondent appeared. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find Level I violations and offer Respondent a nondisciplinary letter of concern citing violations. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning Superior Court Case CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA)/2492, Felicia M. Coplan.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin provided a status update to the Board concerning CV-06-4140 (03F-1782-BOA/03F-1784-BOA). The Board tabled 2492 to allow the Assistant Attorney General to research the matter further.

Review and Action Concerning 2672, Todd E. Sakowicz.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Gabe Corral moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Cynthia Henry seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

BOARD CHAIRPERSON REPORT

None.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

Debb Pearson reported on the status of the Assistant Attorney General's assignments; advised the complaint answer dates that had been extended by staff; reported the following complaint statistics as of 7/31/08 for calendar years 2006, 2007, and 2008:

	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>
Complaints received by Board	209	243	169		
Complaints heard by Board				619	498
<u>OF THOSE COMPLAINTS:</u>					
Complaints dismissed	73	91	33	98	45
Complaints referred to investigation	84	94	34	116	54
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of concern	30	16	7	20	9
Complaints resolved with nondisciplinary letter of remedial action	11	19	6	18	13
Complaints resolved with disciplinary letter of due diligence	6	12	0	9	6
Complaints resolved with probation	53	48	2	44	47
Complaints referred to informal hearing	67	70	1	79	32
Complaints referred to formal hearing	39	39	0	32	36
Complaints resolved with suspension	28	7	1	4	29
Complaints resolved with surrender	2	2	1	2	2
Complaints resolved with revocation	2	4	0	4	2
Complaints resolved with cease and desist letters	24	6	0	4	4
<u>Violation Levels:</u>					
I	35	21	9	25	12
II	11	30	6	23	19
III	22	46	1	41	30
IV	4	8	1	6	5
V	33	6	0	5	25
<u>Additional Information:</u>					
	<u>2005</u>	<u>2006</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2008</u>	
Jurisdiction Expired & Complaints Closed	21	20	11	8	
Denials of New Applications	5	7	7	3	
Denials of Renewal Applications	2	4	1	0	

and advised the Board that a request for a formal opinion from the Attorney General concerning licensees who have previously established U.S. citizenship/permanent lawful presence to again submit documentation with a renewal application had been made on behalf of several agencies, including the Board. The Board approved the request.

NEW BUSINESS

Discussion and Action Concerning Request of Daniel T. McKinnon, Licensed Residential Appraiser #11149, for Consideration of a 15-Hour Qualifying Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) Course.

Michael Marquess moved that the Board deny the request to consider the use of a 15-hour qualifying national USPAP course that does not meet the requirements of the 1998 Criteria and Board rules to meet the requirements of the 1998 Criteria and Board rules because the Board cannot waive the requirements. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Approval of Reciprocal Agreement with the Indiana Real Estate Appraiser Licensure and Certification Board.

Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve the reciprocal agreement. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Attendance on Behalf of the Board at the Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB) Meeting, the State Regulatory Advisory Group (SRAG) Meeting, and the Annual Fall Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials (AARO) to be Held October 3-7, 2008, in Washington D.C.

Cynthia Henry moved that Debb Pearson and Debbie Rudd, Michael Marquess and/or Jeanne Galvin represent the Board at the Appraiser Qualifications Board (AQB) Meeting, the State Regulatory Advisory Group (SRAG) Meeting, and the Annual Fall Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials (AARO) to be held October 3-7, 2008, in Washington D.C. Gabe Corral seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Regarding Approval of Proposed Interagency Service Agreement (ISA) for Appraisal Board Legal Service for Fiscal Year 2009.

Debbie Rudd moved that Les Abrams and Debb Pearson negotiate the terms of the agreement. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Discussion and Action Concerning Statute or Rule Amendments.

The Board made no recommendations concerning amending its rules. Debbie Rudd moved that statutory changes be proposed to increase appraiser application fees and to recover costs for investigations and for formal hearings before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

OUTREACH PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT

Cynthia Henry reported that the Committee had finalized the details of the Flagstaff Board outreach meeting. Les Abrams moved that the Board accept the draft agenda to be finalized closer to the meeting. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Tucson Board outreach meeting be scheduled for Friday, December 5, 2008. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION COMMITTEE REPORT

Debbie Rudd moved that the Board take the following action concerning Best School of Real Estate & Business: (a) accept the segmented qualifying education courses for those appraisers listed in the roster provided to the Board on 8/15/08; and (b) not accept any future segmented qualifying education courses. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Gabe Corral moved that the Board issue a Substantive Policy Statement clarifying that in accepting qualifying education courses to be used as continuing education, it is the Board's policy that the entire qualifying education course be taken and that the qualifying education course cannot be segmented; and that if a qualifying course is taken to be used as continuing education, the examination need not be completed. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Les Abrams recused himself concerning the 2008 Arizona Tax Conference application. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board approve the application as follows:

Submitted by Arizona Tax Conference

- a. 2008 Arizona Tax Conference, #ABA 0807-683 9 hours

*Keith Russell, R.L. Brown, Kitty Decker, John Kendall, Val Courtwright, Marc Goldstone, Kenneth Vass, Caryn Tijsseling, Dean Martin, Harold Scott, Stacy Swanson, Ron Nickelson, David Whiterell, David Dermer, Harold Scott, Roberta Livesay, Stephen Wolf, Kenneth Love, Marci Williams, Todd Crabtree, Anthony Hagenstein

Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Gabe Corral left the meeting. A quorum remained.

APPLICATION REVIEW COMMITTEE REPORT

Debbie Rudd reported the following Arizona appraiser and property tax agent information as of August 16, 2008:

	<u>8/06</u>		<u>8/07</u>		<u>8/08</u>
Licensed Residential	1026		1135		827
Certified Residential	924		1028		1194
Certified General	782		791		955
Nonresident Temporary	71	Total 2805	32	Total 2986	36 Total 3012
Property Tax Agents	309		259		286

Myra Jefferson moved that the Board accept the Committee's recommendations (see attached). Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the license of

Joseph R. Longoria, licensed appraiser #11588, be referred to formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) for noncompliance with a Board order. Les Abrams seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

COMPLAINT REVIEW

Review and Action Concerning 2488, Richard A. Webb.

Respondent did not appear. Jeanne Galvin updated the Board concerning Respondent's court proceedings.

Review and Action Concerning 2529, Jeffrey J. Erhart.

Respondent did not appear. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that, based on the expiration of Respondent's 90-day renewal grace period, the complaint be closed to be reopened and considered in the event Respondent reapplies. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2551, Alice R. Buell.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The motion was withdrawn. Michael Marquess moved that the investigative report be returned to the investigator for additional information. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board reconsider its prior motion. Victor Hartsfield seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Michael Marquess moved that the Board accept the investigative report. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2638, Anthony C. Pierson.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2660, Timothy H. Shaw.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2671, Miranda J. Rapp.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Michael Marquess moved that the Board find no violations and dismiss the complaint. Debbie Rudd seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2678, Donald L. Hall.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the Board find Level III violations and offer Respondent a Consent Agreement and Order of Discipline citing the violations and providing for probation, mentorship and education. Myra Jefferson seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2681, Leonid Zavlunov.

Respondent did not appear. Staff summary was read. Debbie Rudd moved that the matter be referred to investigation. Michael Marquess seconded the motion. The Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Review and Action Concerning 2311/2312/2313/2314/2315, Shahab A. Mehkri.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

Review and Action Concerning 2321, Thomas J. Dozier.

Respondent did not appear. Upon its 12-month file review, the Board instructed staff to proceed with the formal hearing before the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH).

CONFIRMATION OF MEETING DATES, TIMES, LOCATIONS AND PURPOSES

The upcoming Committee and Board meetings were confirmed as follows:

September

17	Application Review Committee	9:00 a.m.
18	Appraisal Testing and Education Committee	7:30 a.m.
18	Board	9:00 a.m.
26	Board Outreach (Flagstaff)	8:30 a.m.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned.

Lester G. Abrams, Chairperson

**RECOMMENDATIONS
COMMITTEE ON APPLICATION REVIEW**

To: Board of Appraisal

From: Application Review Committee

Date: August 21, 2008

Re: August 20, 2008 Recommendations

I. Report on number of Arizona Appraisers and Property Tax Agents:

	<u>8/06</u>		<u>8/07</u>		<u>8/08</u>	
Licensed Residential	1026		1135		827	
Certified Residential	924		1028		1194	
Certified General	782		791		955	
Nonresident Temporary	73	Total 2805	32	Total 2986	36	3012
Property Tax Agents	309		259		286	

II. As a result of its **August 20, 2008 meeting the Application Review Committee makes the following recommendations:**

A. To keep the Board informed concerning accepting applications meeting the 1998 Criteria

B. To refer the following applications to the full Board:

1. 7423 Richard A. Ribacchi
7481 Byron N. Lea

2. Regarding notification by the Oregon Appraiser Certification and Licensure Board of the 5/15/08 Default Final Order of License Revocation and Civil Penalty Assessment of Oregon License L002536 issued to Joseph R. Longoria, Arizona Licensed Appraiser #11588; Licensee's failure to provide requested log to Arizona Board of Appraisal; and Licensee's failure to respond to Board subpoena

C. To take no action regarding additional information provided by:

- 10657 Pamela S. Biggers
11156 Flynn C. Jones

D. To approve the following applications as substantively complete:

1. Renewal applications:

11560 Jacob D. Horner
11573 Thomas E. Chambers
20215 Joseph A. Blagg
20403 Kathleen P. McKenney
20650 Steven A. O'Brien
20781 Carol E. Lain
30276 Michael J. Naifeh
30299 Michael G. Husij

2. Licensed Residential by exam unless noted otherwise:

7475 Donald C. Fowler
7479 Kyle Morgan
7496 Michael L. Nelson
7501 Michael A. Kiley
7503 Matthew P. Kvasnicka
7504 Leslie A. Gates
7509 Donna M. Schneider

3. Certified Residential by exam unless otherwise noted:

7009 Douglas A. Migliorini
7027 Thomas E. Chambers
7099 John J. Kosir
7145 Robert J. Gow
7291 Jonathan M. Sanders
7307 Lacey M. Fouts-Coffman
7404 Franklin T. Jones
7407 Nathan G. Morris
7437 Ryan Adolph-Patrick Fortuna
7445 Brandon K. Pascual
7458 Ingrid L. Williams
7470 Anita M. Dixon
7487 Ryan T. Marble
7518 Jacqueline A. Lozano

4. Certified General by exam unless otherwise noted:

7081 Court C. Kleinman
7159 Timothy T. Roberts

7497 Sara R. Baker
7511 Robert J. Willett

- E.** To approve the following applications as substantively complete and confirm the issuance of the following license/certification:

1. Reciprocity

21935 Russell W. Miller
31650 Thomas J. Hennessy
31651 Jeffrey R. Shouse
31657 Ian A. Ivey
31658 Arvel M. Hale
31661 Jeffrey P. Keller

2. Nonresident Temporary

TP41104 Patrick A. Hallman
TP41105 Hayden B. Gordon
TP41106 Matthew D. Ansay
TP41107 Matthew D. Ansay
TP41108 Carter D. Morrison

3. Renewal

11573 Thomas E. Chambers

- F.** To disapprove the following applications as substantively incomplete and hold until substantively complete:

7460 Tomas E. Rivera
7486 Geraldine K. Easley (by reciprocity)
7507 Jacqueline M. Foti (by reciprocity)
7508 Nicholas A. Mowan
7516 Sean M. Sparks
7519 Sherry A. Oncale (by reciprocity)
7520 Dirk W. Hannon
7521 Daniel M. Cobb
7523 Eric D. Heaton
7529 William A. Dean (by reciprocity)

III. Applications Pending - Substantively Incomplete

6953 Daniel J. Kennedy (by reciprocity)
6998 Stephen Rich (by reciprocity)

7017	Michael J. Heaton
7123	Todd S. Reiser
7200	Larry E. Roush
7349	Austin R. Reissner
7428	Carl Parker III (by reciprocity)

Notification of applicants with substantively incomplete applications who have not responded to the Committee's request for additional information. Pursuant to R4-46-202(D) applicants have up to a year to meet all requirements for license/certificate or applicant's file is to be closed by the Board and applicant shall reapply.

RECOMMENDATIONS

COMMITTEE ON APPRAISAL TESTING AND EDUCATION

TO: Board of Appraisal

FROM: Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education

DATE: August 21, 2008

RE: August 21, 2008 Recommendations

As a result of its August 21, 2008 meeting the Committee on Appraisal Testing and Education makes the following recommendations:

- I. Action regarding **Best School of Real Estate & Business:****

 - A.** Accept the segmented qualifying education courses for those appraisers listed in the roster provided to the Board on 8/15/08
 - B.** Not accept any future segmented qualifying education courses
 - C.** Issue a Substantive Policy Statement that in accepting qualifying education courses to be used as continuing education, it is the Board's policy that the entire qualifying education course be taken and that the qualifying education course cannot be segmented; and that if a qualifying course is taken to be used as continuing education, the examination need not be completed
Recommend approval

- II. Action regarding proposed approval of **qualifying education courses:****
- A. Previously approved by the Board:**
 1. Submitted by American Society of Farm Managers and Rural Appraisers
 - a. **A-25 Eminent Domain**, #ABA 0702-246-10 22 hours
*Paul Bierschwale, Virgil Holtgrewe, Mark Lewis, Jay Luse, Lee Smith, Kim Frome
Recommend approval
 2. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **AP-01Z Real Property Valuation 101**, #ABA 0901-025-01 36 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Gretchen Koralewski, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval

- b. **AP-02Z Real Property Valuation 102, #ABA 0901-026-02** 40 hours
*Tracey Captain, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Gretchen Koralewski, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 - c. **AP-11 General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use, #ABA 0907-688-11** 30 hours
*Tracey Captain, Earl Cass, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Thomas Denny, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Matt Hassett, Thomas Heineman, Kathleen Holmes, Faye Humphrey, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Jim Miller, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, John Wenner, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
 - d. **AP-12 General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach, #ABA 0907-689-12** 30 hours
*Frank Bell, Tracey Captain, Earl Cass, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Matt Hassett, Thomas Heineman, Kathleen Holmes, Faye Humphrey, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Jim Miller, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, John Wenner, Terry Zajac
Recommend approval
 - e. **AP-13 General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach, #ABA 0907-690-13** 30 hours
*Tracey Captain, Earl Cass, Gasper Crimando, Neil Dauler-Phinney, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Matt Hassett, Faye Humphrey, Kathleen Holmes, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Jim Miller, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, John Wenner, David Ziegler
Recommend approval
- 3. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **Statistics, Modeling and Finance, #ABA D1007-700-08 Distance Education** 15 hours
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

- 1. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Online Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach,** 15 hours
Distance Education
*Arlen Mills
Recommend approval

III. Action regarding proposed approval of **continuing education courses**:

A. **Previously approved by the Board:**

1. Submitted by Acheson Appraisal Classes
 - a. **FHA Update**, #ABA 0102-102 4 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
 - b. **2008-2009 National USPAP Update**, #ABA 0403-282 7 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by American Society of Farm Managers and Rural Appraisers
 - a. **All Toppo Maps-General Software Training**, #ABA 1105-486 8 hours
*Mike Johnson
Recommend approval
 - b. **Computer Plotting Legal Descriptions for the Layman**, #ABA 0907-693 8 hours
*Mike Johnson
Recommend approval
3. Submitted by Arizona Tax Conference
 - a. **2008 Arizona Tax Conference**, #ABA 0807-683 9 hours
*Keith Russell, R.L. Brown, Kitty Decker, John Kendall, Val Courtwright, Marc Goldstone, Kenneth Vass, Caryn Tijsseling, Dean Martin, Harold Scott, Stacy Swanson, Ron Nickelson, David Whiterell, David Dermer, Harold Scott, Roberta Livesay, Stephen Wolf, Kenneth Love, Marci Williams, Todd Crabtree, Anthony Hagenstein
Les Abrams recused
Refer to Board
4. Submitted by Beckman Company
 - a. **"Understanding Home Construction"**, #ABA 0706-553 7 hours
*Charles R. Rushmer
Recommend approval
 - b. **The Technical Inspection of Real Estate**, #ABA 0801-013 20 hours
*Charles R. Rushmer
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by Foundation of Real Estate Appraisers
 - a. **Defensive Report Writing**, #ABA 1205-493 3 hours
*Ross Acheson, Daniel Smith, Robert Fabrizio
Recommend approval
 - b. **National Data Collective**, #ABA 1205-494 4 hours
*Ross Acheson
Recommend approval

6. Submitted by McKissock Appraisal School
 - a. **The Cost Approach**, #ABA D1206-602 Distance Education 7 hours
*Alan Simmons
Recommend approval
 - b. **Mortgage Fraud-Protect Yourself!**, #ABA 0907-695 7 hours
*Tracy Martin, Kenneth Guilfoyle
Recommend approval

B. Not previously approved by the Board:

1. Submitted by Allterra Group, LLC
 - a. **Keynote/ Valuation Visionaries**, 7 hours
*Jacqueline Doty, Robert Murphy, Gerald Kifer, Donna Tomposki, Darvis Bozargi, Ralph Sells, Jim Kirchmeyer, Leland Trice
Recommend approval
 - b. **Legislative and Regulatory Updates/ Chief Appraiser Panel**, 7 hours
*Larry Disney, John Brenan, William Garber, George Vann, Richard Davis, Brad Davis, Rick Langdon
Recommend approval
 - c. **Market Metrics**, 7 hours
*William King
Recommend approval
2. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. **Commercial Appraisal Engagement & Review Seminar for Bankers and Appraisers**, 7 hours
*Nikki Griffith
Recommend approval
 - b. **Online Subdivision Valuation**, 7 hours
Distance Education
*Don Emerson
Recommend approval
3. Submitted by Arizona School of Real Estate & Business
 - a. **Appraisal Licensing and Certification Review**, 15 hours
*Tracey Captain, Richard Fasano, Bill Gray, Robert Kaczmarek, Kim Kobriger, Gretchen Koralewski, Don Miner, Roy Morris, Becky Ryan, Ron Schilling, Daniel Smith, Rick Turkian, Gerard Vick, Terry Zajac
Recommend approval
4. Submitted by the Columbia Institute
 - a. **Appraising REO/Foreclosures**, 8 hours
*Bernard Boarnet, Daniel Smith, Raulie L. Irwin, Edmond Fisher, Robert Hetrick, Dr. Samuel Henderson, Amelia Lovorn-Brown, Diana Jacob, Charles Don Clark, Martin Molloy, Bobby Crisp, Roy Morris III, Bryon Reynolds, George Harrison
Recommend approval

- b. **Appraising in Declining Markets**, 8 hours
*Bernard Boarnet, Daniel Smith, Raulie L. Irwin, Edmond Fisher, Robert Hetrick, Dr. Samuel Henderson, Amelia Lovorn-Brown, Diana Jacob, Charles Don Clark, Martin Molloy, Bobby Crisp, Roy Morris III, Bryon Reynolds, George Harrison
Recommend approval
 - c. **FHA Today, No. 114**, 8 hours
*Bernard Boarnet, Daniel Smith, Raulie L. Irwin, Edmond Fisher, Robert Hetrick, Dr. Samuel Henderson, Amelia Lovorn-Brown, Diana Jacob, Charles Don Clark, Martin Molloy, Bobby Crisp, Roy Morris III, Bryon Reynolds, George Harrison
Recommend approval
5. Submitted by Van Education Center
- a. **Residential Environmental Hazards Screening**, 8 hours
Distance Education
*Burton Lee
Recommend approval

IV. Discussion and possible action regarding proposed approval of continuing education credit:

- 1. Submitted by Appraisal Institute
 - a. Daniel L. Swango
 - (1) 405G- General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies, 14 hours
Recommend approval
 - b. Keith E. Russell
 - (1) 100GR-Basic Appraisal Principles, 10 hours
Recommend approval